System Level Theory

Nerida Rixon, Master of Evaluation (Research) student, The Centre for Program Evaluation, The University of Melbourne



- » 1. Research question
- » 2. Methodology
- » 3. Conceptual framework (draft)
- » 4. Analysis grid
- » 5. Early findings
- » 6. What next?

Research Question

What are the necessary components of a system level theory?

Methodology

Conceptual Framework

What should be in a system level theory? And Why?

Element	Sub-element	Exemplars	
Defined problem and clear system	Defined problem	Origin/drivers or causes	
boundaries		Magnitude	
		Persons/groups (target cohort)	
		Consequences	
	Clear boundaries for system	What is in and out of scope?	
		The system's interactions and	
		influences are defined	
		External factors at play	
Defined intended outcomes	Defined outcomes		
Informed by and consistent with multiple	Multiple evidence sources	Social science theory	
sources of evidence and theory		Prior evaluations	
		Stakeholder theory	
		Intervention observations (eval	
		only)	
Methodological individualism	Methodological individualism	Individual actors	
Causal explanation	Variables defined	Sub-element rating	
		Intervention variables (eval only	
		Outcome variables	
		Drivers or causes of problem	
	The middle' defined	Causal mechanisms/steps	
		between variables (intervening	
		processes)	
Necessary conditions for causal links to work	Enablers (events/conditions)		
	External events and conditions (risks)		

Making it work for Outcomes FW and Evaluations

Tricky – though it can be done!

Overlap at sub-element level

Still working out how to deal with this!

Are some elements/ sub-elements more important?

More wedded to some elements than others

Analysis grid

Sub-element	Exemplars	Present (Yes)	Partial	Absent (No)
Defined problem	Origin/drivers or causes	At least three of four exemplars are present	One or two of the exemplars are present	None of the exemplars are present
	Magnitude			
	Persons/groups (target cohort)			
	Consequences			
Clear boundaries for system	What is in and out of scope?	Each of the three exemplars are present	One or two of the exemplars are present	None of the exemplars are present
	The system's interactions and			
	influences are defined			
	External factors at play			
Defined outcomes		Outcomes are defined including through a	Outcomes are referred to though with	No outcomes are referred to
		level of explanatory detail (linking outcomes	minimal explanatory detail	
		to activities, indicators/measures)		
Multiple evidence sources	Social science theory	At least two exemplars are made explicit	One of the four exemplars are made explicit	None of the four exemplars are made explicit
	Prior evaluations			
	Stakeholder theory			
	Intervention observations (eval			
	only)			
Methodological individualism	Individual actors	Theory grounded in methodological	Individuals and individual actions referenced	No reference to individuals or individual
		individualism (noting exlanation must match	at least once	actions
		phenomenon). So individuals and individual		
		actions as central to theory		
Variables defined	Intervention variables (eval only	Evaluations: all three exemplars present	Evaluations: one to two exemplars present	None of the exemplars are present
		Outcomes FW: outcome variables and	Outcomes FW: one exemplar present	
		drivers/causes present		
	Outcome variables			
	Drivers or causes of problem			
The middle' defined	Causal mechanisms/steps between	Causal links between variables made explicit	Some attempt to connect variables but	No reference to causal links
	variables (intervening processes)		explanation limited	
Enablers (events/conditions)		Enablers are defined with explanation	Enablers are alluded to	No enablers are defined
External events and conditions		External events and conditions are defined	External events and conditions are alluded to	No external events and conditions are
(risks)		with explanation		defined

Early findings

Sub-element	Exemplar (where applicable)	Overall rating
Defined problem		X
Clear system boundaries		X
Defined outcomes		\checkmark
Multiple evidence sources		X
Methodological individualism		X
Variables defined		X
	Intervention variables (evaluation only)	✓
	Outcome variables	\checkmark
	Drivers or causes of problem	X
The 'middle' defined		X
Enablers (events/conditions)		X
External events/conditions (risks)		X

What next?

Nerida Rixon nrixon@student.unimelb.edu.au